JASSH 5 (2), 592–605 (2019)

ISSN (O) 2795-9481

# Developmental Constraints among Start-up Textile Enterprises

# Divine Anokam<sup>\*1</sup>, Zeleke Worku<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Tshwane University of Technology Business School, South Africa

<sup>2</sup>Tshwane University of Technology Business School, South Africa

DOI:10.15520/jassh52404

Accepted 30 Jan 2019; Received 22 Dec 2018; Publish Online 18 Feb 2019

#### 1 ABSTRACT

The purpose of the study was to identify and quantify factors that affect the development and growth of the textile industry of the City of Tshwane. Data was collected from a stratified random sample of 250 operators of small, micro and medium-sized enterprises (SMMEs) conducting business in the textile industry of the City of Tshwane. The instrument used to collect data was a structured, pre-tested and validated questionnaire of study consisting of a large number of socioeconomic indicators of viability in the textile industry. Face validity was used for ensuring validity. The Cronbach Alpha test was used for ensuring reliability and internal consistency. Viability of textile businesses operating in and around the City of Tshwane was assessed by assessing profitability. The study found that 75.60% of textile businesses were viable, whereas 24.40% of them were not viable. About 98% of businesses paid tax to SARS regularly. About 26% of entrepreneurs had received training from the South African National Department of Trade and Industry (DTI) or the Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA) at least once in the past. About 75% of businesses had applied for loans at least once in the past. About 27% of businesses had defaulted on loan repayments in the past. Results obtained from cross-tab analyses showed that the viability of textile businesses was significantly associated with the ability of business operators to make profit, ability to secure loan needed for business, ability to order merchandise in bulk on credit, access to foreign textile products, ability to sustain loan repayment, ability to secure loan from commercial banks, ability to secure loan from micro lenders, lengthy duration of business operation, ability to secure valid trade license, registration of textile business for VAT, South African nationality, and the ability of business operators to conduct business with partners, in a decreasing order of strength. Results obtained from binary logistic regression analysis showed that the viability of textile businesses was significantly influenced by 3 predictor variables. These predictor variables were: ability to make profit, ability to secure loan needed for business operation, and ability to order merchandise in bulk on credit, in a decreasing order

of strength.

**Key Words :** City of Tshwane, Textile industry, Viability, Binary logistic regression analysis.

# 2 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF STUDY

The City of Tshwane is the capital of South Africa. It is home to a vibrant textile industry that creates livelihood and employment opportunities for a sizeable portion of the population of the City. According to Marivate (2014), Khale (2015) and Edoho (2015), the textile industry of Tshwane has lost substantial ground to foreign competitors and producers. As a result, the local textile industry has lost ground to importers and producers from countries such as China, Bangladesh, India, Pakistan and Malaysia. Since April 1994, the South African National Department of Trade and Industry (DTI) has carried out various programmes with a view to resuscitate the local textile industry. This effort has led to insignificant achievements to date. Studies conducted by Seeletse (2012) and Henrekson (2014) indicate that the textile industry of Tshwane experiences shortcomings such as lack of specialized skills, lack of capacity for innovating its mode of production and manufacturing, inflexible labour laws, and lack of support from the South African Government. The local textile industry has been overwhelmed by cheap imports from foreign producers and competitors. According to Edoho (2015), the South African local textile industry needs to be protected from foreign competitors and producers by way of tariffs and quota.

The purpose of the study was to identify and quantify factors that affect the development and growth of the textile industry of the City of Tshwane. Data was collected from a stratified random sample of 250 operators of small, micro and medium-sized enterprises (SMMEs) conducting business in the textile industry of the City by using a structured, pre-tested and validated questionnaire of study consisting of a large number of socioeconomic indicators of viability. Face validity was used for ensuring validity. Business viability of textile businesses operating in and around the City of Tshwane was assessed by assessing profitability.

The study was exploratory, and attempts to explain the current state of the textile industry of Tshwane. According to Khale and Worku (2015), more than half of all newly established SMMEs in Tshwane fail in their first three years of business operation due to a number of reasons. The study conducted by Khale and Worku (2013) indicates that the key barriers to sustained viability in newly established businesses in Tshwane are lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of access to finance and the absence of mentorship programmes. The study conducted by Karlstrom and Finstad (2013) indicates that the ability to run successful SMMEs in the textile sector requires advanced entrepreneurial and managerial skills. Kellemen (2003) and Kelly & Swindell (2002) have shown that the quality of municipal service delivery is significantly associated with the survival and profitability of newly established SMMEs in all parts of the world. The authors have shown that countries such as South Korea, Japan, Malaysia, Taiwan and Singapore have managed to promote viability in SMMEs by ensuring adequate municipal service delivery at all levels. Hurlbut and Robert (2012) have pointed out that good governance at municipal level is a critical requirement for sustained growth and development in SMMEs. Hood and Dixon (2010) have shown that transparency and accountability at municipal level is an essential requirement for ensuring long term survival in the SMME sector of the economy in all developing nations such as South Africa.

Alexander (2010) has pointed out that the SMME sector is vital for the creation of jobs for the unemployed youth. A study conducted in Malaysia, Amir, Ahmad and Mohamad (2010) shows how significantly efficient municipal service delivery promotes profitability and long term survival in newly established SMMEs. Similar findings have been reported by development economists such as Ashton (2012), Atkinson (2009), Adams & Mehran (2003) and Aguinis & Kraiger (2009). Marivate (2014) has shown that the textile industry of Tshwane has lost substantial ground to foreign competitors and manufactures since the early 1990s. The study was conducted by collecting data from textile business operators conducting business in parts of the City of Tshwane and the surrounding townships. The primary aim of the study was to describe the basic characteristics of textile businesses in Tshwane. The secondary aim of study was to explore factors that undermine sustained growth and development in textile businesses in Tshwane.

As part of the study, empirical data was collected from textile businesses conducting business in Tshwane on factors that are known to affect viability in SMMEs. Several studies have been undertaken on SMMEs in Tshwane. Studies conducted by Seeletse (2012), Rogerson (2010), Shree & Urban (2012), Worku (2013) identify the key barriers to profitability in newly established SMMEs. According to Ladzani and Netswera (2009), although SMMEs are a key creator of jobs for the unemployed youth, about 75% of all newly established SMMEs fail within their first three years of operation. Job creation in the formal sector frequently takes place at a far lower rate than growth in the labour force (Ligthelm & Van Wyk, 2004:1-4). SMMEs are regarded as the major

GDP contributors and usually create more jobs quantified at about 60% by Business Partners Limited (Bharadwaj, 2013: 169-196). Countries classified as emerging economies, namely Brazil, Israel, India, Ireland and South Africa have realized that it is essential to support and promote this development of SMMEs as a means of growing the national economy and alleviating unemployment and poverty among the masses. Several studies have pointed out the strategic importance of SMMEs to the national economy and GDP (Adams & Mehran, 2003: 123-142).

The study by Amit and Schoemaker (2013: 33-46) shows that it is essential to provide strategic and operational support to SMMEs as a means of enabling them to survive adverse socioeconomic environments. The authors have found that SMMEs are the building blocks of national economies. and that it is almost impossible to promote industrialization without promoting SMMEs in local and global economies. According to the South African National Department of Trade and Industry (2013: 1-12), the South African Government has a policy of supporting and promoting the SMME sector of the national economy as a means of generating jobs and alleviating poverty among the unemployed youth. The study conducted by Ashton (2012: 23-25) shows that countries such as Japan, China, Malaysia, South Korea, USA and Germany managed to grow their national economies by investing in the SMME sector of their national economies.

The study conducted by Barney (2012: 99-120) shows that there are various socioeconomic factors that affect viability and long-term survival in SMMEs. Examples of such factors are level of skills, access to finance, degree of support from the national government, availability of monitoring and evaluation services, training opportunities, quality of infrastructure, and the presence of an economically enabling environment. In the case of SMMEs in and around the City of Tshwane, these factors are well known to hinder the growth and development of SMMEs. The study by Beetsma, Giuliodori, De Jong and Widijanto (2013: 83-101) has shown that shortage of entrepreneurial skills and lack of access of finance hinder the long-term growth and development of SMMEs in the world's developing countries including South Africa. Industrialization enabled large corporations of the developed world to grow globally on a sustainable basis.

Sustained growth in the SMME sector resulted in employment opportunities in most of the world's developed economies. The growth of SMMEs was closely linked with the growth of national economies and GDPs. SMMEs in South Africa are characterized by shortage of technical and entrepreneurial skills. The study by Barney (2012: 99-120) shows that the presence of an economically enabling environment is a key requirement for the sustained growth of the SMME sector of the economy. The growth of SMMEs depends on economic and administrative policies of national governments. Large corporations often fail due to lack of growth in the SMME sector of the economy. At times of economic downturn, the first victims are SMMEs. The SMME sector is vital for the creation of jobs and for the alleviation of poverty and unemployment in the national economy. The

growth of SMMEs is influenced by macroeconomic policies. For example, labour laws affect the degree to which SMMEs can benefit from cheap labour.

The study conducted by Asah, Fatoki and Rungani (2015) shows that the textile industry of Tshwane has lost ground since April 1994 to foreign competitors from countries such as China, South Korea, Malaysia, Turkey, India, Pakistan, Bangladesh and Vietnam due to lack of entrepreneurial skills, over-regulation and lack of support from the South African Government. The study aims to identify and quantify factors that affect sustained viability and profitability in the textile industry of the Tshwane region of Gauteng Province. In the past two decades, the textile industry of Tshwane has been flooded with foreign textile products, and has been declining due to over-regulation, inefficient tax assessment, lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of mentorship programmes, and the absence of monitoring and evaluation programmes (Marivate, 2014). Few studies have been conducted to identify the reason why local textile retailers are unable to compete with their foreign competitors. As part of the study, data will be collected from a representative random sample of size 500 small, micro and medium-sized business enterprises (SMMEs) conducting business in the textile industry of the Tshwane region of Gauteng Province. Stratified random sampling will be used for identifying eligible businesses from the five geographical zones of Tshwane. Quantitative methods of data collection and analyses were used in the study. The study was exploratory in nature. Emphasis was placed on the identification of barriers to sustained growth and development in the textile industry of Tshwane.

The design of study was descriptive and cross-sectional. Data collection was performed in the months of March and April 2016. Data collection was done by using a question-naire of study on a large number of socioeconomic factors that are known to affect viability in the textile industry of Tshwane. Ethical clearance was obtained from Tshwane University of Technology prior to data collection. Eligible respondents were selected for the study by using a sampling frame obtained from Statistics South Africa. The sample population was selected by means of probability sampling. This was done by using stratification in which zones were used as a stratification criterion. All in all, data was collected from a stratified random sample of size 250 business operators in the textile industry of the City of Tshwane.

The capacity to render reliable and highly efficient emergency and rescue services is crucially important for metropolitan municipalities such as the CTMM to grow on a sustainable basis. Such capacity is also needed for fulfilling the routine needs and operational requirements of businesses that operate in the CTMM. To this end, the City of Tshwane needs to develop adequate capacity for rendering reliable and efficient emergency and rescue services by utilizing modern technology and highly innovative methods and strategies. Doing so requires drawing on examples set out by large municipalities such as New York, London and Tokyo. The City of Tshwane is the Capital City of South Africa and the seat of Government. As such, it is expected

to render world-class emergency and rescue services to all inhabitants living and conducting business in the City. The City of Tshwane invests heavily on the management of municipal solid and liquid waste in order to ensure cleanliness in the general environment, and to minimize the spread of vector-born communicable diseases. The need to minimize the spread of communicable diseases poses risk to the City of Tshwane and its inhabitants. As such, the City invests on health and sanitation requirements as a means of minimizing risk to the health condition of its inhabitants. Since April 1994, the City of Tshwane has taken numerous steps by replacing traditional methods of waste management by modern methods of environmental management and sanitation. It has also made a huge investment to upgrade its infrastructural capacity by utilizing modern technological equipment and infrastructure over the past several years.

According to the South African Small Enterprises Development Agency (SEDA, 2016), the failure rate of newly established SMMEs that conduct business in the footwear and textile industry of Tshwane is above 30%. There is a shortage of studies that identify the key barriers to sustained growth and development in the footwear and textile industry of Tshwane. The study aims to fill the gap in the relevant literature by performing a secondary data analysis of valuable data sets that are freely available to the general public at Statistics South Africa.

The study by Buckley and Ghauri (2012) shows that the South African economy depends significantly on global macroeconomic conditions that affect the degree to which SMMEs grow on a sustainable basis. Since the early 1990s, SMMEs operating in the South African textile industry have been exposed to massive cheap imports from countries such as China, Bangladesh, Pakistan, India, Malaysia and Vietnam. The South African economy has since 1994 been faced with trials of reintegration into the global economy. To reach economic growth through competitiveness, employment generation and income redistribution, the growth of small businesses has been prioritized since post the apartheid error in the year 1995. The promotion and development of SMMEs is a critical policy focus area of South Africa, identified in 1995 with the White Paper on Small Business and most recently in the National Development Policy. The key rationale for the promotion of SMMEs is the potential this sector offers the economy in terms of its ability to create employment and automatically decrease unemployment rate in the country. A wide range of policies, policy programmes and initiatives have subsequently been initiated in this respect (Carr, 2013; Calvin, 2012).

### 3 OBJECTIVES OF STUDY

The objective of study is to identify factors that affect profitability in the textile industry in the City of Tshwane. The study aims to define the characteristics of small enterprises operating in the textile industry of the City of Tshwane, and estimate the percentage of businesses that are viable. It also aims to identify factors that are detrimental to sustained development and growth in the textile industry. One key aim

of the study was to assess the degree to which the textile industry of Tshwane competes to foreign competitors from countries and to propose suitable and feasible corrective actions that could aid small and medium-sized enterprises in Tshwane.

The study has the following specific objectives:

To identify and quantify factors that adversely affect SMMEs in the textile industry of Tshwane; and To identify entrepreneurial skills and other forms of support that could add value to the current capacity of entrepreneurs in the textile industry of Tshwane.

#### 4 LITERATURE REVIEW

The purpose of the study is to identify and quantify key factors that are responsible for failure in small SMMEs operating in the central business district of Tshwane. The South African textile industry is highly competitive. There are major players from countries like China that import high quality textile products and sell their merchandise at cheap prices. Support of SMMMEs is crucial in the initial stages of the business. Guidance and technically equipping the business owners with the necessary skills as well as a mentorship relationship overlooking the early stages is essential. SMMEs struggle in the early stages of establishment because they have to deal with highly priced administrative costs Pangarkar (2007). In the midst of the varying factors that have been identified and specified as factors affecting viability, some remain unanimously mentioned by various authors. According to the SMME survey conducted by AfricaGrowth in 2012, the top two limiting factors affecting SMMEs are; firstly government taxes and regulation and the operating environment, these including employee labour costs as well as labour policies, this was highlighted due to the difficulties with employing people due to stringent labour laws that favour the employee and not the businesses.

According to Henrekson (2014), Edoho (2015), Marivate (2014), Khale (2015), Worku (2015) and Seeletese (2012), sustained growth and development in the textile industry of Tshwane is significantly affected by the following socioeconomic factors:

According to the World Economic Forum (2012) macroeconomic stability is defined as a national economy that has minimised vulnerability to external shocks, which in turn increases its prospects for sustained growth. Macroeconomic stability is said to behave as a buffer against currency and interest fluctuations in the global market. It is essential, yet an insufficient requirement for growth.

The Interim Discussion Paper, complied by Impact Trust regarding South African regulatory framework (2012) stipulated that all these elements are vital requisites for the viability and sustainability of SMMEs. These factors influence the start-up costs, as well as the transactional and day to day running of SMMEs. Insufficient focus is placed on these factors in developing countries. Poor legal outline tends to results in difficulty acquiring funding from banking sector. A firm legal framework needs to be a starting

point when promoting SMMEs. This needs to be maintained throughout the lifetime of the businesses. In order for this to be coherently feasible, government is required to collaborate with the process ensuring that relevant regulatory policies are in place this is according to a report from the Department of Trade and Industry (2005). The Task Group of the Policy Board for Financial Services and Regulation (2001) argues that coordination from the government needs to filter through from national level to regional level; to address SMME needs in each area. This is because the SMMEs are government by local municipalities; the effectiveness of these municipalities has a direct impact of the success of the SMMEs. There is no room for operational incompetence in regional municipalities, which is close to impossible to achieve. Adding to these operational inefficiencies is the reality of corruption within the justice administration caused by political interference. It is crucial to have a favourable human resource environment, structured to promote SMME development. This kind of human resource environment needs to go hand in hand with supported entrepreneurship cultures arising from knowledge business operations and the economic impact thereof. This then reinforces the importance of skills training and education for SMME business owners. It is prudent for newly established SMMEs to collaborate with well-established business organisations as a means of acquiring skills development, training and education.

According to Marivate (2014), access to finance is a key cause of failure and bankruptcy in newly established SMMEs in the textile industry. Numerous surveys that have been conducted have reflected that, the SMMEs are of the view that it is rather problematic to gain access to funding in South Africa (Turner et al, 2008). It seems that the amount of training available as well as the finance support made available is crucial to the success of SMMEs. Respondents to the FinScope Small Business Survey (2010); cited that in terms of the nature of small businesses, they considered space to operate and competition as the biggest hinders of growth, access to finance was third on this list. This could be attributed to the fact that South Africa has a well-developed financial sector.

According to Seeletse (2012), a sizeable proportion of economically significant SMMEs cannot obtain finance from commercial banks due to failure to produce adequate collateral. Furthermore, it is often alleged that (i) many entrepreneurs or SMMEs that do not currently have access to funds would have the capability to use those funds productively if the funds were available; (ii) but due to structural characteristics, the formal financial system does not provide finance to such entities. Adding to this, Kim Abildgren, Peter Askjær Drejer and Andreas Kuchler (2013) argue that SMMEs who apply for finance through the banks experience a high rejection rate due to various barriers. Lack of awareness about funding opportunities provided by SEDA to the SMME sector of the textile industry of Tshwane is a major barrier. Lack of alignment between the needs of SMMEs and programmes of assistance that are available to SMMEs in the textile industry of Tshwane by institutions such as SEDA and DTI is also a barrier. Meeting the requirements of a business loan, by adhering to business criteria is a key barrier. This is because most SMMEs are informal or unregistered. Banks require collateral.

Although the lack of financing is being cited as a constraint, South Africa has various programmes dedicated to funding as well as financing schemes. It appears that the problem lies in the awareness of these programmes, which is seemingly low (DTI, 2008). It can be inferred that the problem lies in the administration and regulation of these programmes.

There are characteristics within an SMME is structured that are said to contribute to the difficulties in funding, specifically for SMMEs, two of which have been stipulated below. Size of SMME: It is generally known that by virtue of being an SMME you become subjected to lower chances of financing compared to large organisations, this also applies in Tshwane. According to the World Bank Enterprise Survey 2008, some of the most important objective indicators of access are: actual use of credit products, only 59% of small and medium enterprises had any credit products as compared to 82% for large firms. Microenterprises are more likely to report access to finance as one of the top three obstacles to growth, are less likely to have a bank account, and less likely to have access to any of the credit products (loans, overdrafts or lines of credit). As firms grow larger, access becomes easier (Mengistae et al., 2010). Related to size, SMMEs tend to seek finance for relatively small amounts. The costs involved in the credit assessment and monitoring of a loan or investment make it disproportionately more expensive to provide funds to an SMME (Falkena et al., 2004). In most OECD countries, however, banks perceive SMME finance as an attractive line of business and have developed effective monitoring mechanisms as a result (OECD, 2006).

### METHODS AND MATERIALS

The design of this study was descriptive and cross-sectional. It was descriptive because the aim of the study was to explain and describe factors that affect the degree of satisfaction of residents of the City of Tshwane on emergency and rescue services that are routinely provided to inhabitants of the City of Tshwane. The study was cross-sectional because data was collected from the 394 participants who took part in the study once only. According to Frank (2009), a descriptive study design is suitable for an exploratory study. The total number of businesses in the textile industry of Tshwane is more than 50, 000 according to the South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2016). The sample size of study was equal to 250. Stratified random sampling (Lakens, 2013) was used for selecting a random sample of size 250 SMMEs in the textile industry of Tshwane. A total of 250 eligible textile businesses were selected from the 5 geographical zones of the City of Tshwane (50 textile businesses were selected from each of the 5 geographical zones (central, east, west, north and south) of Tshwane.

The level of significance of study is fixed at the  $\alpha = 0.05$ level of significance. The sample size of study is denoted by, and is determined using the formula shown below:

$$n = \frac{Z^2_{1-\frac{\alpha}{2}} \times P(1-P)}{d^2}$$

 $n = \frac{Z^2_{1-\frac{\alpha}{2}} \times P(1-P)}{a^2}$  In the above expression, the following values of  $\alpha$  and d were used:

$$\alpha = 0.05 = \text{level of significance}$$

$$Z_{1-\frac{\alpha}{2}} = Z_{1-\frac{0.05}{2}} = Z_{1-0.025} = Z_{0.975} = 1.96$$

= value of standard normal random variable at  $\alpha$  = 0.05 level of significance

P = 0.60 (the percentage of start-up businesses in the textile industry of Tshwane that fail in less than 3 years of establishment according to Marivate (2014)

$$1 - P = 0.40$$

d is the margin of error = 0.05

The instrument used for data collection was a structured,

pre-tested and validated questionnaire consisting of 37 indicators of viability in the textile industry. The questionnaire consisted of factors that affect profitability and long-term survival of SMMEs operating in the textile industry. Each of the 250 operators in the study had to provide answers to 37 questions related to viability in the textile industry. Measurements of perceptions were done by using a 5-point ordinal scale. Face validity was used for ensuring validity. The Cronbach Alpha test was used for ensuring reliability and internal consistency.

A briefing was provided the textile business operators who were selected for the study on the following topics:

- · A brief description about the purpose of the study;
- $\cdot$  A description of what participation will involve in terms of activities and duration;
- · A statement indicating that participation in the study was voluntary, and that respondents were free to terminate the study at any time of their choice without having to explain the reason why;
- · An assurance that responses obtained from respondents would be kept in confidence, and that analysis and reports would be made anonymous; and
- · An offer to provide detailed information about the study upon completion of the study.

According to Frank (2009), a structured questionnaire is ideal for gathering information from respondents effectively without introducing bias. A questionnaire is highly beneficial in cases where all respondents of study understand the subject matter of study equally well. A questionnaire presents questions to respondents in a near identical manner. A questionnaire is an ideal tool for gathering data in quantitative studies. A structured questionnaire has the following benefits:

- · Relatively economical;
- · Less time consuming than conducting interviews;
- · Very large samples can be taken;
- · Can ensure anonymity;
- · Contain questions for specific purposes;
- · Existing questionnaires can be used or modified; and
- · There are different techniques by which interaction with respondents can be conducted, namely, face-to-face, electronic and telephonic.

#### 6 LIST OF VARIABLES OF STUDY

The questionnaire had a total of 37 questions. In Part 1 of the questionnaire, there were questions about the personal characteristics of textile business operators. In Part 2, there were questions about factors that are known to affect viability and profitability in the textile industry. Appendix A shows a copy of the questionnaire of study. The questionnaire was adapted from the questionnaire of study developed by Garenko and Bititci (2007) for conducting a similar study.

# 6.1 Dependent variable of study (Y)

A composite index was generated based on indicators of service quality. This was done by following the method introduced by (Bel, Fageda & Warner, 2010: 553-577). Accord-ingly, the dependent variable was defined as a dichotomous variable (a variable that can have 2 possible values only). Thus, each of the 250 textile businesses in the study was allocated a score for viability. The dependent variable of study (Y) had two possible values. These were viable or not viable. In symbols, the variable Y had two possible values:

$$Y = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if textile bu sin ess is not viable} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$
$$X_1, X_2, \dots, X_k$$

are independent or explanatory variables that affect viability (Y).

# 7 METHODS OF DATA ANALYSES

Quantitative methods of data collection and analyses are applicable in the study. Quantitative methods frequency tables, cross-tab analyses and logit analysis were used for performing statistical data analyses (Hosmer & Lemeshow, 2013: 141-142). Face validity was used for confirming valid-ity, whereas the Cronbach Alpha test was used for verifying reliability and internal consistency (Ritchie, Lewis, Nicholls & Ormston, 2013). The dependent variable of study is vi-ability of business. This is a dichotomous variable of study as it can only have 2 possible values (viable, or not viable). According to Hair, Black, Rabin and Anderson (2010), the following statistical methods of data analysis are applicable for conducting multivariate statistical data analyses in the proposed study:

Frequency tables for categorical variables of study Summary statistics for continuous variables of study Bar charts, pie charts and box plots Cross-tab analyses for pairs of categorical variables Logit and probit regression analysis (Hosmer & Lemeshow, 2013)

# 8 RESULTS OF DATA ANALYSES

Table 1 shows frequency proportions that indicate the general characteristics of the 250 participants of study. About 76% of textile businesses were viable, whereas about 24% of them were not viable. About 72% were actual owners, whereas about 28% were employed managers. About 30% had ages of 31 to 40 years of age. About 88% of operators were male, about 36% of operators were married, about 16% (matric level or less).

Table 2 shows frequency proportions for past experience on loan application and repayment. About 43% of textile businesses were in operation for 11 years or more. About 66% of business operators were educated in South Africa. About 54% of operators employed between 1 and 3 employees in their businesses. About 73% of business operators used textile products imported from outside South Africa in their businesses. About 75% of businesses had borrowed loan at least once for business operation in the past. About 27% of business operators had defaulted on loan repayment in the past. About 26% of business operators had experienced problems in the course of applying for loan from commercial banks in the past. About 29% of business operators had experienced problems in the course of applying for loan from microfinance institutions.

Table 3 shows frequency proportions for the ability of the 250 business operators to order textile merchandise in bulk on credit from suppliers. About 74% of textile businesses were capable of ordering textile merchandise in bulk from suppliers on credit. About 35% of business operators had experienced at least one robbery in the past. Thirty-eight percent of businesses used private security firms for ensuring safety and security at their businesses. Weekdays were peak sale time for about 85% of businesses. About 57% of businesses experienced peak sale during summer. Seventy-four percent of businesses had valid trade licenses. About 22% of business operators owned their business premises.

Table 4 shows frequency proportions for attributes such as registration for VAT, payment of tax to SARS (South African Receiver of Revenue) on a regular basis, ability to draw up business plans, and ability to perform accounting and audit-related tasks. About 72% of textile businesses were registered for VAT. About 97% of businesses paid tax to SARS on a regular basis. About 61% could develop business plans. About 37% could make oral presentations of their businesses.

Table 5 shows frequency proportions for attributes such as satisfaction with the quality of municipal services provided to textile businesses by the City of Tshwane and awareness about assistance programmes provided to SMMEs by DTI and SEDA. It can be seen from the table that about 57% of textile businesses were satisfied with the quality of municipal services that were provided to them by the City of Tshwane. About 83% of businesses were aware of assistance programmes provided to SMMEs by DTI and SEDA. About 83% of businesses were aware of assistance programmes provided to SMMEs by DTI and SEDA. About 26% of business operators had actually attended at least one training session by DTI or SEDA. About 30% of businesses were started up with initial capitals of R50, 000 to R100, 000. About 24% of businesses had net monthly profits of R10, 000 to R50, 000.

Table 6 shows frequency proportions for attributes such as utilisation of a business partner and the frequency with which stock is ordered by the textile businesses in the study. About 43% of businesses were run in partnership. About 37% of businesses purchased stock once in 6 months. About 33% of businesses purchased stock many times per month.

Table 1. General characteristics of respondents (n=250)

Variable of study	Percentage
Viability of textile	Viable: 189 (75.60%)
business	Not viable: 61 (24.40%)
Status of operator	Owner: 179 (71.60%)
	Employed manager: 71 (28.40%)
Age category of	20 or younger: 8 (3.20%)
respondents	21 to 30: 44 (17.60%)
	31 to 40: 76 (30.40%)
	41 to 50: 78 (31.20%)
	51 or older: 44 (17.60%)
Gender of operator	Male: 219 (87.60%)
	Female: 31 (12.40%)
Highest level of	Matric level or less: 40 (16.00%)
education	Certificate: 42 (16.80%)
	Diploma: 100 (40.00%)
	Bachelor's degree: 52 (20.80%)
	Master's degree or above: $14 (6.40\%)$
Marital status	Single: 61 (24.40%)
	Married: 89 (35.60%)
	Divorced: 55 (22.00%)
	Widowed: 2 (0.80%)
	Living together: 43 (17.20%)
Nationality of	South African: 147 (58.80%)
operator	Foreigner: 103 (41.20%)

**Table 2.** Past experience of loan application and repayment (n=250)

Variable of study	Percentage
Duration of operation of textile business	5 years or less: 56 (22.40%)
	6 to 10 years: 87 (34.80%)
	11 years or more: 107 (42.80%)
Country where education was acquired	In South Africa: 166 (66.40%)
	Outside South Africa: 84 (33.60%)
Number of employees employed in business	None: 24 (9.60%)
	1 to 3: 134 (53.60%)
	4 to 6: 74 (29.60%)
	7 or more: 18 (7.20%)
Source of textile merchandise	Local producers: 67 (26.80%)
	Foreign producers: 183 (73.20%)
Experience of taking loan for business operation in the past	Yes: 187 (74.80%)
	No: 63 (25.20%)
Past experience of defaulting on loan repayment	Yes: 67 (26.80%)
	No: 183 (73.20%)
Past experience of difficulty in securing loan from	Yes: 66 (26.40%)
commercial banks	No: 184 (73.60%)
Past experience of difficulty in securing loan from	Yes: 73 (29.20%)
microfinance institutions	No: 177 (70.80%)

In Table 7, it can be seen that the viability of textile businesses is significantly associated with 12 variables. These 12 variables are: ability to make profit, ability to secure loan needed for business, ability to order merchandise in bulk on credit, access to foreign textile products, ability to sustain loan repayment, ability to secure loan from commercial banks, ability to secure loan from micro lenders, lengthy duration of business operation, ability to secure valid trade license, registration of textile business for VAT, South African nationality, and ability to conduct business with partners, in a decreasing order of strength. Table 8 shows odds ratios estimated from logit analysis. The table shows the top 3 most influential predictors of viability.

The percentage of overall correct classification for this procedure was equal to 79.11%. The P-value obtained from the Hosmer-Lemeshow goodness-of-fit test was equal to 0.1207 > 0.05. This indicates that the fitted logistic regression model is fairly well reliable. The odds ratio of the variable "Ability to make profit" is equal to 3.59. This indicates that a business operator who is unable to make profit is 3.59 times as likely to be non-viable in comparison with another business operator who is capable of making profit. The odds ratio of the variable "Ability to secure loan needed for business" is 3.51. This indicates that a business operator who is unable to make profit is 3.51 times as likely to be non-viable in comparison with another business operator who is capable of making profit. The odds ratio of the variable

**Table 3.** Duration of operation of textile business (n=250)

Variable of study	Percentage
Ability to order textile merchandise in bulk on	Yes: 185 (74.00%)
credit	No: 65 (26.00%)
Past experience of at least one robbery	Yes: 87 (34.80%)
	No: 163 (65.20%)
Utilisation of private security services	Yes: 95 (38.00%)
	No: 155 (62.00%)
Time for more sales	Week days: 213 (85.20%)
	Weekends: 37 (14.80%)
Season for more sales	Autumn: 16 (6.40%)
	Spring: 24 (9.60%)
	Summer: 142 (56.80%)
	Winter: 68 (27.20%)
Possession of a valid trade license	Yes: 185 (74.00%)
	No: 65 (26.00%)
Renewal of trade license every year	Yes: 243 (97.20%)
	No: 7 (2.80%)
Ownership of premises used for business	Own: 54 (21.60%)
operation	Rent: 196 (78.40%)

Table 4. Registration for VAT by textile business (n=250)

Variable of study	Percentage
Registration for VAT	Yes: 179 (71.60%)
	No: 71 (28.40%)
Payment of tax to SARS on a regular	Yes: 243 (97.20%)
basis	No: 7 (2.80%)
Ability to draw up business plan	Good: 92 (36.80%)
	Above average: 31 (12.40%)
	Average: 29 (11.60%)
	Below average: 90 (36.00%)
	Poor: 8 (3.20%)
Ability to make oral presentations	Good: 35 (14.00%)
	Above average: 31 (12.40%)
	Average: 28 (11.20%)
	Below average: 120 (48.00%)
	Poor: 36 (14.40%)
Ability to network with business rivals	Good: 94 (37.60%)
and competitors	Above average: $30 (12.00\%)$
	Average: 38 (15.20%)
	Below average: $84 (33.60\%)$
	Poor: 4 (1.60%)
Assessment of accounting skills	Good: 76 (30.40%)
	Above average: 27 (10.80%)
	Average: 28 (11.20%)
	Below average: 83 (33.20%)
	Poor: 36 (14.40%)

"Ability to order merchandise in bulk on credit" is equal to 2.61. This indicates that a business operator who is unable to order merchandise in bulk on credit is 2.61 times as likely to be non-viable in comparison with another business operator who is capable of ordering merchandise in bulk on credit.

# 9 MAJOR FINDINGS OF STUDY

The study found that 75.60% of textile businesses were viable, whereas 24.40% of them were not viable. About 98% of businesses paid tax to SARS regularly. About 26% of entrepreneurs had received training from the South African

National Department of Trade and Industry (DTI) or the Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA) at least once in the past. About 75% of businesses had applied for loans at least once in the past. About 27% of businesses had defaulted on loan repayments in the past. Results obtained from cross-tab analyses showed that the viability of textile businesses was significantly associated with the ability of business operators to make profit, ability to secure loan needed for business, ability to order merchandise in bulk on credit, access to foreign textile products, ability to sustain loan repayment, ability to secure loan from commercial banks, ability to secure loan from micro lenders, lengthy duration of business operation, ability to secure valid trade license, registration of textile business for VAT,

Table 5. Assessment of the quality of municipal services (n=250)

Variable of study	Percentage
Degree of satisfaction with municipal	Good: 68 (27.20%)
services provided to textile businesses	Above average: 24 (9.60%)
	Average: 50 (20.00%)
	Below average: 73 (29.20%)
	Poor: 35 (14.00%)
Awareness about assistance	Yes: 207 (82.80%)
programmes to small businesses by	No: 43 (17.20%)
DTI and SEDA	
Attendance of at least one training	Yes: 66 (26.40%)
programme from DTI or SEDA	No: 184 (73.60%)
Degree of satisfaction with the quality	Good: 19 (7.60%)
of assistance provided to SMMEs by	Above average: 7 (2.80%)
DTI or SEDA	Average: 35 (14.00%)
	Below average: 5 (2.00%)
	Poor: 0 (0.00%)
	Question not applicable: 184 (73.60%)
Start-up capital in Rand	R10, 000 or less: 20 (8.00%)
	R10, 001 to R50, 000: 44 (17.60%)
	R50, 001 to R100, 000: 76 (30.40%)
	R100, 001 to R200, 000: 72 (28.80%)
	More than R200, 000: 38 (15.20%)
Net monthly profit in Rand	R10, 000 or less: 40 (16.19%)
	R10, 001 to R50, 000: 59 (23.89%)
	R50, 001 to R100, 000: 56 (22.67%)
	R100, 001 to R200, 000: 22 (8.91%)
	More than R200, 000: 13 (5.26%)
	Question not applicable: 57 (23.08%)

Table 6. Assessment of the quality of municipal services (n=250)

Variable of study	Percentage
Utilisation of a business partner	Yes: 107 (42.80%)
	No: 143 (57.20%)
Number of times stock is purchased	Many times a month: 82 (32.80%)
from suppliers	Once a month: 66 (26.40%)
	Once in 6 months: 93 (37.20%)
	Once a year: 9 (3.60%)

Table 7. Results obtained from cross-tab analyses (n=250)

List of 12 variables significantly associated with viability of textile businesses	Chi-square value	P-value
Ability to make profit	241.5288	0.000***
Ability to secure loan needed for business	209.0432	0.000***
Ability to order merchandise in bulk on credit	190.7532	0.000***
Access to foreign textile products	182.6696	0.000***
Ability to sustain loan repayment	165.1378	0.000***
Ability to secure loan from commercial banks	143.8000	0.000***
Ability to secure loan from micro lenders	115.5299	0.000***
Lengthy duration of business operation	8.5840	0.014*
Ability to secure valid trade license	7.4678	0.006**
Registration of textile business for VAT	7.3889	0.007**
South African nationality	5.5412	0.019*
Ability to conduct business with partners	9.0498	0.003**

Legend: Significance of association at \* P<0.05; \*\* P<0.01; \*\*\* P<0.001

 ${\bf Table~8.}~{\bf Results~from~logit~analysis}$ 

Factors that affect viability	OR	P-value	95% C. I.
Profitability of business	3.59	0.000	(2.21, 6.74)
Ability to secure loan	3.51	0.000	(2.18, 6.63)
Ability to order merchandise on credit	2.61	0.000	(1.74, 4.86)

South African nationality, and the ability of business operators to conduct business with partners, in a decreasing order of strength. Results obtained from binary logistic regression analysis showed that the viability of textile businesses was significantly influenced by 3 predictor variables. These predictor variables were: ability to make profit, ability to secure loan needed for business operation, and ability to order merchandise in bulk on credit, in a decreasing order of strength.

The City of Tshwane to create an economically enabling environment for textile businesses should thrive. The study by Zhang (2010) has shown that there is a significant association between improved municipal service delivery and viability of textile businesses. Sustainability in SMMEs depends upon various socioeconomic and political factors such as effective leadership, sound planning, consultation with stakeholders, accountability, objectivity, fairness, motivation of employees, the availability of skills that are required for emergency and rescue operations, and the ability of municipalities to utilize modern technological applications and resources according to approved plans of action. Sound planning is a result of a thorough review of the relevant literature and empirical evidence obtained from previous similar situations in which emergency crises have been resolved efficiently and to the satisfaction of the communities affected adversely. Hadaya and Pellerin (2010: 477-504) have pointed out that monitoring and evaluation techniques are vital for ensuring efficiency in the management of emergency and rescue operations, and that consistency in the quality of service delivery is critical for the provision of satisfactory service delivery. Quality assurance is a result of consistent delivery of services over the past several years. Trust and past track record are significantly associated with each other. It is vital to maintain a solid track record of efficient service delivery in order to maintain the trust and confidence of residents, ratepayers and stakeholders in the various parts of the City of Tshwane.

#### 10 RECOMMENDATIONS OF STUDY

Based on findings obtained from the study, the following recommendations are made to the South African National Department of Trade and Industry (DTI), the South African Small Business Development Agency (SEDA), the South African National Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) and the South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (SACCI) with a view to improve viability in SMMEs operating in the textile industry of the City of Tshwane. The recommendations have the potential for improving the plight of struggling SMMEs in the textile industry of the City of Tshwane.

# REFERENCES

 ACHRYA V, PHILIPPON T, RICHARDSON M, ROUBINI N. The financial crisis of 2007–2009: causes and remedies. New York: John Wiley & Sons; 2009.

- [2] ADAMS RB, MEHRAN H. Is corporate governance different for bank holding; 2003.
- [3] companies? Federal Reserve Bank of. New York Economic Policy Review:9(1):123–142.
- [4] AGUINIS H, KRAIGER K. Benefits of training and development for individuals and teams, organizations, and society. Annual review of psychology. 2009;60(1):451–474.
- [5] AMIT R, SCHOEMAKER PJH. Strategic Assets and Organizational Rent. Strategic Management Journal. 2013;14(1):33–46.
- [6] AIGBAVBOA C, THWALA W. Residents' perception of subsidised low-income housing in South Africa: a case study of Kliptown, Johannesburg. Journal of Human Ecology. 2013;42(1):17–23.
- [7] ALEXANDER P. Rebellion of the poor: South Africa's service delivery protests—a preliminary analysis. Review of African Political Economy. 2010;37(123):25—40.
- [8] AMIR AM, AHMAD NNN, MOHAMAD MHS. An investigation on PMS attributes; 2010.
- [9] ARAGON-SANCHEZ A, BARBA-ARAGÓN I, SANZ-VALLE R. Effects of training on business results1. The International Journal of Human Resource Management. 2003;14(6):956-980.
- [10] ARMSTRONG P, SEGAL N, DAVIS B. Corporate Governance: South Africa, a Pioneer in Africa, The South African Institute of International Affairs, Global Best Practice, report no; 2005.
- [11] ASAH F, FATOKI OO, RUNGANI E. The impact of motivations, personal values and management skills on the performance of SMMEs in South Africa. African Journal of Economic and Management Studies. 2015;6(3):308–322.
- [12] ASKIM J, JOHNSEN A, CHRISTOPHERSEN KA. Factors behind organizational learning from benchmarking: experiences from Norwegian municipal benchmarking networks. Journal of Public Administration Research Theory. 2008;18(2):297–320.
- [13] ASHTON S. Securing a structural advantage. [Online]. Available from; 2012. Available from: http://www.investec. co.za/.
- [14] ATKINSON D. Post-apartheid Local Government Reform: A small Town Perspective; 2009.
- [15] BARNEY JB. Firm Resources and Sustained Competitive Advantage. Journal of Management. 2012;17(1):99–120.
- [16] BEKELE E, WORKU ZB. Factors that affect the long term survival of micro, small and medium enterprises in Ethiopia. South African Journal of Economics. 2008;76(3):548–568.
- [17] BEL G, FAGEDA X, WARNER ME. Is private production of public services cheaper than public production? A metaregression analysis of solid waste and water services. Journal of Policy Analysis and Management. 2010;29(3):553– 577.
- [18] BENJAMIN G, ANDREAS B, RAMON K. Organization from a systemic perspective: Application of the viable system model to the Swiss Youth Hostel Association. Kybernetes. 2012;39(9-10):1627–1644.
- [19] BEZUIDENHOUT A, NENUNGWI AL. A competency framework for the small business sector in Johannesburg, South Africa. African Journal of Business Management. 2012;6(47):11658–11669.
- [20] BHARADWAJ A. A Resource-Based Perspective on Information Technology Capability and Firm Performance: An Empirical Investigation. MIS Quarterly. 2013;24(1):169–196.
- [21] BHATT GD, GROVER V. Types of Information Technology Capabilities and Their Role in Competitive Advantage:

- An Empirical Study. Journal of Management Information Systems. 2013;22(2):253-277.
- [22] BLOODGOOD JM. Organizational routine breach response and knowledge management. Business Process Management Journal. 2012;18(3):376–399.
- [23] BRANDON PR, SMITH NL, TRENHOLM C, DEVANEY B. Evaluation exemplar: the critical importance of stakeholder relations in a national, experimental abstinence education evaluation. American Journal of Evaluation. 2010;31(1):517–531.
- [24] BOOYSENS I. Are small, medium and micro-sized enterprises engines of innovation? The reality in South Africa. Science and Public Policy. 2011;1(67-78).
- [25] BROWNSON CD. Does constituent of entrepreneurial culture differ in individuals? International Journal of Small Business and Entrepreneurship Research. 2014;2(2):22–27.
- [26] BUCKLEY PJ, GHAURI PN. Globalisation, Economic Geography and the Strategy of Multinational Enterprises. Journal of International Business Studies. 2012;2(81-98).
- [27] CALVIN RJ. Entrepreneurial Management. New York: McGraw-Hill; 2012.
- [28] CARR NG. IT doesn't matter. Harvard Business Review. 2013;3(4):41–49.
- [29] CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPAL-ITY. 2016. Annual report on the City of Tshwane for; 2014. Available from: http://www.tshwane.gov.za/.
- [30] CORNETT MM, MCNUTT JJ, TEHRANIAN H. The financial crisis, internal corporate governance, and the performance of publicly-traded US bank holding companies. Boston: Boston College; 2010.
- [31] N, CULKIN SMITH, D. An emotional business: A guide to understanding the motivations of small business takers. Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal. 2010;3(3):145–157.
- [32] DALEY-HARRIS S. Microcredit campaign strategies and social business movement: What can the social business movement learn from the early promotion of microcredit? The Journal of Social Business. 2011;1(1):46–61.
- [33] DASANAYAKA SWSB, SARDANA GD. Development of SMEs through clusters: a comparative study of India, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. World Review of Entrepreneurship, Management and Sustainable Development. 2010;6(1/2):50-70.
- [34] DAWSON A. A case study of impact measurement in a third sector umbrella organization. International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. 2010;59(6):519–533.
- [35] DIERDORFF EC, SURFACE EA. Assessing training needs: do work experience and capability matter? Human performance. 2007;21(1):28–48.
- [36] DICK GPM, GALLIMORE K, BROWN JC. Exploring performance attribution: the case of quality management. International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. 2009;58(4):311–328.
- [37] MASCIO DI, R. A method to evaluate service delivery process quality. International Journal of Service Industry Management. 2007;4(418 – 442).
- [38] DOOST RK, FISHERMAN T. Searching for answers: Managerial Auditing. Journal. 2004;19(5):623–639.
- [39] DUBRESSON A. Abidjan: From the public making of a modern city to urban management of a metropolis. [Online] Available. 2012; from: Available from: http://www.greenstone.org/greenstone3/.
- [40] DUNN A, RILEY CA. Supporting the not-for-profit sector: the Government's review of Charitable and Social Enterprise. The Modern Law Review. 2004;4(437-438).

- [41] DZANSI DY, DZANSI LW. Understanding the impact of human resource management practices on municipal service delivery in South Africa: An organizational justice approach. African Journal of Business Management. 2010;4(6):995–1005.
- [42] EDOHO FM. Entrepreneurialism: Africa in transition. African Journal of Economic and Management Studies. 2015;6(2):127–147.
- [43] ELLIOT R, BOSHOFF C. The influence of organisation factors in small tourism businesses on the success of internet marketing. Management Dynamics. 2013;14(3):58.
- [44] EVANS JR. Quality Management, Organization. Western: Cengage Learning; 2011. .
- [45] FAHY J. The resource-based view of the firm: some stumbling-blocks on the road to understanding sustainable competitive advantage. Journal of European Industrial Training. 2013;21(2):94–104.
- [46] FAUCONNIER A, MATHUR-HELM B. Black economic empowerment in the South African industry: A case study of Exxaro limited. South African Journal of Business Management. 2013;39(4):1–14.
- [47] FRANK A. How to Conduct Surveys: A Step-by-step Guide. New York: SAGE; 2009.
- [48] FAHLENBRACH R, STULZ RM. Bank CEO incentives and the credit crisis. Journal of Financial Economics. 2011;99(1):11–26.
- [49] FAHY J. The resource-based view of the firm: some stumbling-blocks on the road to understanding sustainable competitive advantage. Journal of European Industrial Training. 2013;21(2):94–104.
- [50] FENN P, GRAY A, RICKMAN N, VENCAPPA D, RIVERO O, LOTTI E. Enterprise liability, risk pooling, and diagnostic care. Journal of Public Administration Research Theory. 2010;20(2):225–242.
- [51] GARENKO P, BITITCI U. Towards a contingency approach to performance measurement: An empirical study in Scottish SMEs. International Journal of Operations & Production Management. 2007;27(8):802–825.
- [52] GHOTBABAD A, R BAHARUN, R, FEIZ S. A review of services quality model. Journal of Marketing. 2012;2(3):12– 16
- [53] GOLAM-HOSSAN C. Employee Training and Development. Management Research News. 2007;30(12):955–956.
- [54] GOOD GOVERNANCE LEARNINF NETWORK (GGLN). 2015. Recognising Community voice and dissatisfaction. [Online]. Available from; Available from: http://www.content.eisa.org.za.
- [55] GRANT RM. The Resource-based Theory of Competitive Advantage. California Management Review. 2013;33(3):114–135.
- [56] GUMEDE V. Import demand elasticity's for South Africa: A co-integration analysis. Journal for Studies in Economics and Econometrics. 2012;24(1):21–28.
- [57] GARENGO P, BITITCI U. Towards a contingency approach to performance measurement: an empirical study in Scottish SMEs. International Journal of Operations & Production Management. 2007;27(8):802–825.
- [58] GARY R. Supported employment: evidence for an evidence-based practice. Psychiatric Rehabilitation Journal. 2004;27(4):345–359.
- [59] GERDIN J, GREVE J. Forms of contingency fit in management accounting research a critical review. Accounting, Organizations and Society. 2004;29(3/4):303–326.
- [60] GLOBERMAN S, MIKE WP, DANIEL MS. Corporate governance and Asian companies. Asia Pacific Journal of Management. 2011;28(1):1–14.

- [61] GREATBANKS R, TAPP D. The impact of balanced scorecards in a public sector environment – empirical evidence from Dunedin City Council, New Zealand. International Journal of Operations & Production Management. 2007;27(8):846–873.
- [62] GREILING D. Performance measurement in the public sector: the German experience. International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. 2005;54(7):551–567.
- [63] HADAYA P, PELLERIN R. Determinants and performance outcome of manufacturing SMEs use of internet-based IOISs to share inventory information. International Journal of Electronic Business. 2010;8(6):477–504.
- [64] HAIR JF, BLACK WC, BABIN BJ, ANDERSON RE. Multivariate Data Analysis: A Global Perspective. London: Pearson: 2010.
- [65] HAMANN RKHAGRAM, S, ROHAN S. South Africa's charter approach to post-apartheid economic transformation: Collaborative governance or hardball bargaining. Journal of South African Studies. 2008;34(1):21–37.
- [66] HENREKSON M. Entrepreneurship, innovation, and human flourishing. Small Business Economics. 2014;43(3):511–528.
- [67] HOOD C, DIXON R. The political payoff from performance target systems: no-brainer or no- gainer? J Public Adm Res Theory. 2010;20(2):281–298.
- [68] HOSMER DW, LEMESHOW S. Applied Logistic Regression Analysis. New York: John Wiley & Sons; 2013.
- [69] HURLBUT JB, ROBERT JS. Good governance connects science and society. Journal of Policy Analysis and Management. 2012:.
- [70] KARLSTROM H, FINSTAD T. The Stedegenhet of Nordic STS. Nordic Journal of Science and Technology. 2013;1(1):5-11.
- [71] KEASEY K, WRIGHT M. Issues in corporate accountability and governance. Journal of Accounting and Business Research. 2007;91(13):291–303.
- [72] KELEMEN ML. Managing quality. London: Sage Publications; 2003.
- [73] KELLY JM, SWINDELL D. A Multiple-Indicator Approach to Municipal Service Evaluation: Correlating Performance Measurement and Citizen Satisfaction across Jurisdictions. Public Administration Review. 2002;62(1):610–621.
- [74] KHALE S. Assessment of the quality of municipal services in the City of Tshwane, South Africa. Journal of Corporate Governance and Control. 2015;13(1):678–695.
- [75] KHALE S, WORKU Z. Factors that Effect Municipal Service Delivery in Gauteng and North West Provinces of South Africa. African Journal of Science, Technology, Innovation and Development. 2013;2(3):61–70.
- [76] KHALE S, WORKU Z. Benefits of good corporate governance principles: A study of the City of Tshwane. South Africa Journal of Corporate Governance and Control. 2015;13(1):753-770.
- [77] KING ME. The King III report on corporate governance for South Africa. Johannesburg: Institute; 2009.
- [78] KING ME. The King IV report on corporate governance for South Africa. Johannesburg: Institute; 2015.
- [79] KIRSTEN M, ROGERSON CM. Tourism, business linkages and small enterprise development in South Africa. Development Southern Africa. 2012;19(1):29–59.
- [80] KLOOT L. Performance measurement and accountability in an Australian fire service. International Journal of Public Sector Management. 2009;2(128-145).

- [81] KOTABE M, MURRAY JY. Global procurement of service activities by service firms. International Marketing Review. 2004;21(6):615–633.
- [82] KOTLER N, P KOTLER. Strategy and marketing: designing missions, building audiences, generating revenue and resources. San: Francisco; 2008.
- [83] KOPPELL JGS. Global governance organizations: legitimacy and authority in conflict. Journal of Public Administration Research Theory. 2008;18(2):177–203.
- [84] KRUGELL W, OTTO H, MERWE VANDER, J2009. Local Municipalities and Progress with the Delivery of. North West University;.
- [85] KOTLER P, KELLER KL. Marketing Management. New York: Prentice Hall: 2009.
- [86] KOVACEVIC N. Righting wrongs: Affirmative action in South Africa. Harvard International Review. 2012;1(12-15)
- [87] LADZANI WM, NETSWERA GF. Support for rural Small Businesses in Tshwane, South Africa. Development Southern Africa. 2009;26(2):14–21.
- [88] LAKENS D. Calculating and reporting effect sizes to facilitate cumulative science: a practical primer for t-tests and ANOVAs. Frontiers in Psychology. 2013;4(1):863–871.
- [89] LETTICE F, ROTH N, FORSTENLECHNER I. Measuring knowledge in the new product development process. International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. 2006;55(3/4):217–241.
- [90] LINNA PPEKKOLA, UKKO S, J, MELKAS H. Defining and measuring productivity in the public sector: managerial perceptions. International Journal of Public Sector Management. 2010;23(3):300–320.
- [91] MAFUNISA M. Measuring efficiency and effectiveness in local government in South Africa. Journal of public Administration. 2004;39(2):290–301.
- [92] MAHADEA D. Prospects of Entrepreneurship to the Challenge of Job Creation in South Africa. Journal of Developmental Entrepreneurship. 2012;4(1-17).
- [93] MAGASA L, AWOSEJO OJ, WORKU Z. Factors improving firm performance in competitive intelligence on small and medium enterprises in Gauteng, South Africa. African Journal of Computing & ICT. 2015;8(3):53–68.
- [94] MARCOUX AM. A fiduciary argument against stakeholder theory. Business ethics quarterly. 2011;6(1–24).
- [95] MARIVATE SP. The impact of entrepreneurial skills on the viability and long term survival of small businesses: a case of the City of Tshwane, South Africa. European, Journal of Business, Economics and Accountancy. 2014;2(2):53–72.
- [96] J MATEF, FUERST WL, BARNEY JB. Information Technology and Sustained Competitive Advantage: A Resource-Based Analysis. MIS Quarterly. 2013;2(487 – 505).
- [97] MWANGI RM, SEJJAKA S, CANNEY S, MAINA R. Constructs of Successful and Sustainable; 2013. Available from: http://www.trustafrica.org/.
- [98] NEL E, ROGERSON C. Pro-Poor Local Economic Development in South Africa's Cities. Africa Insight. 2005;35(4):2–15.
- [99] PENG MW, RABI SB, SEA-JIN C. Asia and global business. Journal of International Business Studies. 2010;41(1):373–376.
- [100] PEREGO P, HARTMANN F. Aligning performance measurement system with strategy: the case of environmental strategy. Journal of Accounting, Finance and Business Studies. 2009;45(4):397–428.

- [101] PRAHALAD CK, HAMEL G. The core competence of the corporation. Harvard Business Review. 2014;6(1):79–92.
- [102] PRETORIUS D, SCHURUNIK W. Enhancing service delivery in local government: the case of a district municipality. South African Journal of Human Resource Management. 2007;5(3):19–29.
- [103] PRIYANKA P. Service delivery and corruption in public services: how does history matter? American Economic Journal: Applied Economics. 2010;2(3):190–204.
- [104] RAMSEOOK-MUNHURRUN P, LUKEA-BHIWAJEE SD, NAIDOO P. Service Quality in Public Service. International Journal of Management and Marketing Research. 2010;3(1):38–43.
- [105] RANDEREE K, MAHAL A, NARWANI A. A business continuity management maturity model for the UAE banking sector. Business Process Management Journal. 2012;18(3):472. 492.
- [106] RADNOR JZ, BARNES D. Operational Performance Management International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. 2007;56(5/6):384–396.
- [107] RANTANEN H, KULMALA HI, LONQVIST A, INEN R, KUJANSIVU P. Performance measurement systems in the Finnish public sector. International Journal of Public Sector Management. 2007;20(5):415–433.
- [108] REICH BH, BENBASAT I. Factors that influence the social dimension of alignment between business and information technology objectives. MIS Quarterly. 2012;2(4):81– 113.
- [109] RITCHIE J, LEWIS J, NICHOLLS MC, ORMSTON R. Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers. New York: SAGE; 2013.
- [110] ROGERSON CM. Successful SMMEs in South Africa: the case of clothing producers in the Witwatersrand. Development Southern Africa. 2010;17(5):687–716.
- [111] ROSS JW, BEATH CM, GOODHUE DL. Developing long term competitiveness through information technology assets. New York: McGraw-Hill; 2013.
- [112] ROSSOUW GJ, WATT VANDER, A, MALAN DJ. Corporate governance in South Africa. Journal of Business Ethics. 2002;37(3):289–302.
- [113] SAABAOUL Z. Risk-based capital standards and bank behaviour in emerging and developing countries. Journal of International Banking Regulation. 2011;12(2):180–191.
- [114] SANCHEZ R. Understanding competence-based management - Identifying and managing five modes of competence. Journal of Business Research. 2012;57(1):518-532.
- [115] SCHMID MM, ZIMMERMANN H. Leadership structure and corporate governance in Switzerland. Journal of Applied Corporate Finance. 2008;20(1):109–120.
- [116] SEELETSE SM. Common causes of small businesses failure in the townships of West Rand district municipality in the LimpopoProvince of South Africa. African Journal of Business Management. 2012;6(44):10994–11002.
- [117] SHREE S, URBAN B. Internationalisation of South African SMEs: The role of capital factors. Acta Commercii. 2012;12(1):186–199.
- [118] SOUTH AFRICAN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY. 2016. Business confidence index Press release [Online]. Available from; Available from: http://www.sacci.org.za/.
- [119] Annual report for; 2016. Available from: Availablefrom:.
- [120] ;. Available from: http://www.thedti.gov.za/.
- [121] SOUTH AFRICAN SMALL ENTERPRISE DEVELOP-MENT AGENCY (SEDA). 2016. Annual report for; 2014. Available from: http://www.seda.org.za/.

- [122] SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT COMMUNICA-TION AND INFORMATION SYSTEM. 2004. The Municipal Finance Management Act Number 56 of 2003. [Online]. Available from; Available from: http://www.info.gov.za/ acts/2003/a56-03/index.html.
- [123] SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT COMMUNICA-TION AND INFORMATION SYSTEM. 2004. The Municipal System Act Number 32 of; 2000. Available from: http://www.info.gov.za/acts/2000/a32-00/index.html.
- [124] SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT COMMUNICA-TION AND INFORMATION SYSTEM. Pretoria: Government Printer; 1996.
- [125] Batho Pele principles. [Online]. Available from; 2016. Available from: http://www.dpsa.gov.za/batho-pele/index.asp.
- [126] AUDITOR-GENERAL SOUTHAFRICAN. Annual Report for the financial year 2013/2014. [Online]. Available from; 2015. Available from: http://www.df.gov.za/reports/index.asp.
- [127] SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION SYSTEM; 1996. Available from: www.info.gov.za/documents/constitution/1996/a108-96.pdf.
- [128] SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION SYSTEM. 2000. Municipal Systems Act of 2000; 2000.
- [129] SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT COMMUNICA-TION AND INFORMATION SYSTEM. 2003. Local Government Municipal Financial Act of; 2000.
- [130] SOUTH AFRICAN NATIONAL DEPARTMENT OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE AND TRADITIONAL AFFAIRS. 2009. Speech by Sicelo Shiceka: Minister of Corporate Governance and Traditional Affairs. [Online]. Available from; Available from: http://www.cogta.gov.za/index.php/.
- [131] SOUTH AFRICAN NATIONAL DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION. 2016. Operation PHAKISA. [Online]. Available from: www.operationphakisa.gov.za/.
- [132] PARLIAMENT SOUTHAFRICAN. NCOP debates provincial week report. [Online]. Available from; 2016. Available from: http://www.parliament.gov.za/live/.
- [133] PARLIAMENT SOUTHAFRICAN. Accelerating service delivery and addressing challenges through effective cooperative governance [Online]. Available from: www.parliam ent.gov.za [Accessed: 22; 2015.
- [134] BANK SOUTHAFRICANRESERVE. Annual report 2014 [Online]. Available from; 2015. Available from: http://www.resbank.co.za/pages/default.aspx.
- [135] CORPORATION STATA. User's guide for STATA version 14. College Station, Texas: STATA Corporation; 2015.
- [136] AFRICA STATISTICSSOUTH. Results of Census; 2012.
- [137] TUCKER M, PITT M. Customer performance measurement in facilities management: A strategic approach. International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. 2009;58(5):407–422.
- [138] THOMSON I. The International Integrated Reporting Council. Journal of Critical Perspectives on Accounting. 2015;27(1):18–22.
- [139] TOD B. Strengthening accountability for improved service delivery: SNV's local capacity development approach. [Online]. Available from; 2012. Available from: http://www.thepowerofhow.org/.
- [140] PROGRAMME UNITEDNATIONSDEVELOPMENT. Human Development Report. [0nline]. Available from; 2016. Available from: http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/.

- [141] URBAN W. Service Quality Gaps and their role in service enterprises development. Baltic Journal on Sustainability. 2009;15(4):631–645.
- [142] WALDT VANDER, G. Managing local government performance: key consideration and challenges. Journal of Public Administration. 2006;2(129-131).
- [143] DOOREN VAN, W. What makes organizations measure? Hypotheses on the causes and conditions for performance measurement. Financial Accountability & Management. 2005;21(3):363–383.
- [144] VARGO SL, LUSCH RF. Evolving to a new dominant logic for marketing." Journal of Marketing. 2004;68(1):1–17.
- [145] VERBEETEN FH. Performance management practices in public sector organizations: impact on performance. Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal. 2008;21(3):427–454.
- [146] WADE M, HULLAND J. Review: Resource-Based View of. IS Research MIS Quarterly. 2013;28(1):107–142.
- [147] WOLF J, EDGAR B. Measuring quality of services and provision in homelessness. European Journal of Homelessness. 2007;1(1):15–39.
- [148] WALSH P. Dumbing down performance measures. Measuring Business Excellence. 2005;9(4):37–45.
- [149] WERBACK A. When sustainability means more than green. Mckinsey Quarterly. 2009;4(2):74–79.
- [150] WORKU Z. Analysis of factors that affect the longterm survival of small businesses in Pretoria, South Africa. Journal of Data Analysis and Information Processing. 2013;1(1):110–129.
- [151] WORKU Z. Differential factors of long-term survival in small and medium-sized business enterprises in Pretoria, South Africa. Journal of Business and Economics. 2014;5(11):2091–2104.
- [152] WORKU Z. Barriers to the development of entrepreneurial activities in newly established small, micro and mediumsized enterprises in Tshwane. Journal of Corporate Ownership and Control. 2015;3(12):332–340.
- [153] WORKU Z. The impact of poor quality municipal services on small enterprises. Investment Management & Financial Innovations. 2016;14(4):274–279.
- [154] WORLD BANK. World development report: making services work for poor people. Washington DC: World Bank; 2016.